

The Jonathan Greenlaw Problem

William D Romanski
wdromanski@hotmail.com
April 2019

There were 4 Jonathan Greenlaw in Charlotte County born before 1800. Which Jonathan do each of these records refer to? Which Jonathan was the son of Ebenezer, and which the son of Jonathan? Who were the other 2?

Conclusion: Most of the records refer to one Jonathan. This Jonathan was the son of Ebenezer.

Jonathan Greenlaw occurrences in the records before 1851 census

1784: 1 Jonathan Greenlaw adult. 2 Jonathan Greenlaw over 10

1791: Deed Lot 56 Andrew Martin to Jonathan Greenlaw Jr. Mortgage 1791. Disposed 1819 to Ebenezer. 2 Jonathan Greenlaw adults implied by "Jr"

1796: Deed Mill privileges Jonathan Greenlaw Jr sold to him by John Lymburner [m Elizabeth Greenlaw d Jonathan]

1796: Marriage record Jonathan Greenlaw m Sarah Greenlaw

1800: Petition for Chamcook Jonathan Greenlaw wife and 2 children. With Henry Card, John Rigby m Rebecca Greenlaw [d Jonathan]

1802: Deed lot 44 Jonathan Greenlaw Jr 100 acres. No disposal.

1807: Petition for Pleasant Ridge Jonathan Greenlaw Senr wife 1 son 5 daughters

1807: Deed Mill privileges Jonathan Greenlaw and Sarah Greenlaw r Chamcook Lake

1811: Granted 2 lots at Chamcook.

1815: Deed Lot 7 Chamcook Jonathan Greenlaw 3rd "granted to me."

1819: Deed Lot 56 Jonathan Greenlaw sold to Ebenezer m Ann

1821: Petition "Jonathan Greenlaw the third" with others for land in Waweig. Were there 3 adults? Jonathan Greenlaw bef 1771, Jonathan D Greenlaw. John Greenlaw 1776? John C Greenlaw?

1822: Assessment: Jon D Greenlaw [1795 s Thomas m Elizabeth Davis], John Greenlaw [1776? s Ebenezer m Eunice or John C Greenlaw 1796 s Ebenezer m Ann], Jonathan Greenlaw [by 1771 s Ebenezer m Eunice], Jonn Greenlaw ("Little") [1776? s Ebenezer m Eunice or John C Greenlaw 1796 s Ebenezer m Ann]

1831: Assessment County: John D Greenlaw [s Thomas m Elizabeth Davis], John Greenlaw [s Ebenezer m Ann], Jonathan Greenlaw.

1832: Deed Lot 3 Chamcook Jonathan Greenlaw 2nd and wife Sarah. Mentions daughter Harriet

1851: Census Jonathan and Sarah r Waweig Lot 7

* * *

Working backward

Jonathan Greenlaw enumerated in the 1851 census must be the same who:

1851: Census Jonathan and Sarah r Waweig Lot 7

1832: Deed Lot 3 Chamcook Jonathan Greenlaw 2nd and wife Sarah. Mentions daughter Harriet

1831: Assessment County: John D Greenlaw [s Thomas m Elizabeth Davis], John Greenlaw [s Ebenezer m Ann], Jonathan Greenlaw.

1822: Assessment: Jon D Greenlaw [s Thomas m Elizabeth Davis], Jonathan Greenlaw, Jonn Greenlaw ("Little")

1815: Deed Lot 7 Chamcook Jonathan Greenlaw 3rd "granted to me."

1811: Granted 2 lots at Chamcook.

1807: Petition for Pleasant Ridge Jonathan Greenlaw Senr wife 1 son 5 daughters
1807: Deed Mill privileges Jonathan Greenlaw and Sarah Greenlaw r Chamcook Lake
1800: Petition for Chamcook Jonathan Greenlaw wife and 2 children. With Henry Card, John Rigby m Rebecca Greenlaw [d Jonathan]
1796: Deed Mill privileges Jonathan Greenlaw Jr sold to him by John Lymburner [m Elizabeth Greenlaw d Jonathan]
And if he was married and had 2 children at the time of his 1800 petition, then he must be:
1796: Marriage record Jonathan Greenlaw m Sarah Greenlaw

* * *

Jonathan D Greenlaw and Jonathan Greenlaw 3d

It makes sense that the Jonathan Greenlaw who petitioned for land at Chamcook in 1800, was granted in 1811 and sold it in 1815 are the same person. The 1815 deed calls the grantor "Jonathan Greenlaw 3d" and declares that the lot was granted to him. The moniker "Jonathan Greenlaw the third" is found only once more in the records, in an 1821 petition made for land in Waweig. It is clear that this Jonathan is not the same as the Chamcook Jonathan, as he is 26 years old in 1821, making him only 4 or 5 at the petition for Chamcook, and perhaps 15 at the time of the Chamcook grant. Either the "3d" was used to describe 2 different people, or one of these instances is a copying error.

It clear, though, that the 1821 "Jonathan Greenlaw the third" is the same as Jonathan D Greenlaw. Jonathan D Greenlaw married Sarah Greenlaw in Robbinston, Maine, in 1824. Jonathan s Thomas Greenlaw m Elizabeth Davis was baptized in 1796, which is consistent with the age given in the 1821 petition. The 1822 and 1831 assessments called him "Jon D Greenlaw" and "John D Greenlaw," respectively, and he doesn't appear in subsequent assessments. His estate was probated in 1834, naming him as "Jonathan D Greenlaw."

Jonathan D Greenlaw being called 3d in the 1821 petition, suggests there is still 3 Jonathan Greenlaws living at the time. The 1822 assessment give 4 John or Jonathan Greenlaws:

Jon D Greenlaw

John Greenlaw

Jonathan Greenlaw []

Jonn Greenlaw ("Little") [1776? s Ebenezer m Eunice or John C Greenlaw 1796 s Ebenezer m Ann]

Roughly corresponding to Jonathan D Greenlaw, John Greenlaw 1776? s Ebenezer m Eunice or John C Greenlaw 1796 s Ebenezer m Ann, and Jonathan Greenlaw b by 1771 s Ebenezer m Eunice. Jonathan being called "3d" in 1821 suggests that there was no confusion between Johns and Jonathans; perhaps Jonathan Greenlaw s Jonathan Greenlaw was still living this late.

* * *

The Connection between the Greenlaws who settled in Saint Patrick and the Cards

Card being such a rare name in the area, it wouldn't be unreasonable to suggest that Mary Card and Henry Card were relatives, possibly siblings. This close relation between the Cards and the Greenlaws might explain the parallel movements of the families.

Several Greenlaws settled in Saint Patrick in the 1820s or 1830s:

Elizabeth m Ephraim Black,

Henry m Elthea Little,

Eleanor m Patrick Flinn,
Mary m William Shane,
Levi m Mary Montgomery, and
Almira m Davis Collins.
These are probably siblings.

Saint Patrick is closely linked to West Isles and Eastport. In fact Eleanor was living in the West Isles at the time of her marriage to Patrick Flinn, and later they lived in Eastport. Henry Card petitioned for land at Chamcook along with Jonathan Greenlaw and others, but was not granted. He soon settled on Deer Island. His children either remained on the island or settled in Eastport. No other Greenlaws settled in Saint Patrick, and only one other in West Isles. Perhaps it was their relatives the Cards that drew this family away from Chamcook.

Due to the complete lack of evidence, I would have liked to completely throw out the oft-repeated notion of Jonathan Greenlaw marrying Sarah Stinson, making the Sarah surviving until the 1851 the Sarah Greenlaw he married in 1796. But to look at the genealogy and the narrative, I see space for Mary Card. This would necessitate a third marriage. I suppose that he could have married Sarah Stinson, but I would still like to see some evidence.

* * *

Inferences considering the One Jonathan Hypothesis

Jonathan Greenlaw m 1796 Sarah Greenlaw m 1800 Mary Card m by 1807 Sarah Stinson.

These are some things we can conclude about the family:

1. Sarah Greenlaw m Jonathan Greenlaw died about 1800.
2. Two children born before 1800, according to the petition of that year, have not been identified. They may be the Mary Phoebe, and Rebecca baptized at All Saints.
3. Mary Card would have died by 1807, when Sarah is identified in a deed as the wife of Jonathan.
4. Henry Greenlaw may have been named for Henry Card. Mary Greenlaw m William Shane may have been the first daughter of Sarah Stinson, named for the recently deceased Mary Card. Alternatively, Mary may have been the last child of Mary Card, the mother having died in childbirth or soon thereafter.

* * *

Brothers Jonathan s Ebenezer and Ebenezer s Ebenezer lived and worked closely together throughout their lives. In fact they appear to have occupied the same farm for several years, and to have both lived out the remainder of their lives on the same lot.

Jonathan purchased Lot 56 in 1791, and eventually deeded it to Ebenezer. It appears the brothers lived there for a while before Jonathan moved to Chamcook by 1807. Ebenezer mortgaged the lot in 1819, and sold out in 1821. It was about this time that he moved to the area then called the Waweig Lake District. In 1826 he petitioned for a grant of land that he had already improved there, the grant coming in 1839. Ebenezer's son Richard also settled on the lot.

Jonathan remained at Chamcook until about 1832, when he sold out to his daughter Harriet. Harriet and her husband James Nason Greenlaw sold out the next year.

In 1851, four households were living on Ebenezer's Waweig Lake lot: Ebenezer's widow Ann, Jonathan and his wife, Richard, and Harriet. It is likely they were all there since the 1830s when the other lots were disposed of. Ebenezer died sometime between 1848 and 1851. Jonathan died before 1861.

Jonathan s Jonathan never married, and left no descendants. Consequently, the only claimants on his father's lot in Bayside were descendants of his brother Thomas.

Conclusion

Jonathan Greenlaw m Elizabeth had a son Jonathan, called Junior, who owned the grant of Lot 44 in 1802, and probably died before the 1822 assessment.

Jonathan D Greenlaw, also called Jonathan Greenlaw 3d, was the son of Thomas Greenlaw s Jonathan Greenlaw m Elizabeth Lamb.

Ebenezer Greenlaw m Eunice had a son Jonathan. He married 3 times, to Sarah Greenlaw in 1796, Mary Card in 1800, and Sarah Stinson by 1807. He petitioned and was granted at Chamcook. He moved to Lot 7 in Waweig, his brother Ebenezer's grant, where he was living in 1851.